

## EXHIBIT 2

---

**From:** Steindler, Tom <tsteindler@mwe.com>  
**Sent:** Friday, September 6, 2019 12:57 PM  
**To:** Laura Miller; NPC-PLEX  
**Cc:** SERVICE-BRAF  
**Subject:** RE: Plexxikon v. NPC - Case No. 4:17-cv-04405-HSG (EDL)

Laura: It turns out I was mistaken; the updated production of sales figures we made in March only included data through the end of 2018.

THOMAS P. STEINDLER

Partner

**McDermott Will & Emery LLP** The McDermott Building, 500 North Capitol Street, NW, Washington, DC 20001-1531

**Tel** +1 202 756 8254   **Mobile** +1 202 251 0478   **Email** [tsteindler@mwe.com](mailto:tsteindler@mwe.com)

[Biography](#) | [Website](#) | [vCard](#) | [Twitter](#) | [LinkedIn](#)

---

**From:** Laura Miller <LMiller@durietangri.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 5, 2019 1:45 PM  
**To:** NPC-PLEX <NPC-PLEX@mwe.com>  
**Cc:** SERVICE-BRAF <SERVICE-BRAF@durietangri.com>  
**Subject:** RE: Plexxikon v. NPC - Case No. 4:17-cv-04405-HSG (EDL)

**[ External Email ]**

Tom,

Having reviewed the transcript from the CMC last Thursday, we note your statement to the Court that Novartis “provided, earlier this year, damages -- sales figures for 2019 up until that point in time,” and your related statement that Dr. Leonard “had 2019 data.” We are not aware of any such production. Please provide the Bates label information for the documents to which you referred.

Best,  
Laura

---

**From:** Laura Miller  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 29, 2019 11:55 AM  
**To:** 'NPC-PLEX' <[NPC-PLEX@mwe.com](mailto:NPC-PLEX@mwe.com)>  
**Cc:** SERVICE-BRAF <[SERVICE-BRAF@durietangri.com](mailto:SERVICE-BRAF@durietangri.com)>  
**Subject:** RE: Plexxikon v. NPC - Case No. 4:17-cv-04405-HSG (EDL)

Counsel,

We have received no response to my email below. Please immediately supplement Novartis's document production to include sales data through the present, as required by FRCP 26(e).

Best,  
Laura

---

**From:** Laura Miller  
**Sent:** Saturday, August 24, 2019 9:47 AM  
**To:** NPC-PLEX <[NPC-PLEX@mwe.com](mailto:NPC-PLEX@mwe.com)>  
**Cc:** SERVICE-BRAF <[SERVICE-BRAF@durietangri.com](mailto:SERVICE-BRAF@durietangri.com)>  
**Subject:** Plexxikon v. NPC - Case No. 4:17-cv-04405-HSG (EDL)

Counsel,

Pursuant to the obligations imposed by Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(e), please immediately supplement Novartis's document production responsive to Request Nos. 34 & 35 regarding sales data for Tafinlar, including sales data for 2019 to date. *See, e.g., Finjan, Inc. v. Bitdefender Inc.*, Case No. , 2019 WL 3564443, \*2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 6, 2019) ("Case law confirms that the fact discovery cutoff does not terminate the obligation to supplement."); *see also* Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(e), Advisory Committee Notes to the 1993 Amendments ("Supplementations need not be made as each new item of information is learned but should be made at appropriate intervals during the discovery period, ***and with special promptness as the trial date approaches.***"') (emphasis added); Cal. Prac. Guide Fed. Civ. Pro. Before Trial § 11:1241.

Best,

Laura Miller | Attorney | **Durie Tangri LLP** | 415-362-6666 | [lmiller@durietangri.com](mailto:lmiller@durietangri.com)

---

This message is a PRIVATE communication. This message and all attachments are a private communication sent by a law firm and may be confidential or protected by privilege. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or use of the information contained in or attached to this message is strictly prohibited. Please notify the sender of the delivery error by replying to this message, and then delete it from your system. Our [Privacy Policy](#) explains how we may use your personal information or data and any personal information or data provided or made available to us. Thank you.

---

Please visit <http://www.mwe.com/> for more information about our Firm.